

Review

Reviewed Work(s): THE PHOENIX INDIAN SCHOOL: Forced Assimilation in Arizona, 1891-1935 by Robert A. Trennert,

Review by: L. G. Moses

Source: *The Journal of Arizona History*, Vol. 30, No. 3 (Autumn, 1989), pp. 351-352

Published by: Arizona Historical Society

Stable URL: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/41695770>

Accessed: 14-08-2018 03:59 UTC

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <https://about.jstor.org/terms>



JSTOR

Arizona Historical Society is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Journal of Arizona History*

Books

to be commended for the excellent maps and charts that accompany that study; a recommendation that does not follow for the Ruiz work, which unfortunately contains no illustrations or maps. In all, however, these two books are excellent contributions to the history of border culture and dependency.

W. DIRK RAAT

State University of New York, Fredonia

THE PHOENIX INDIAN SCHOOL: Forced Assimilation in Arizona, 1891-1935. By Robert A. Trennert, Jr. Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1988. Illus., notes, biblio., 272 pages. \$22.95 (hard cover).

ROBERT TRENNERT, PROFESSOR AND CHAIR of the history department at Arizona State University, has written an engrossing case study of federal education policy and American Indians through the first four decades of the twentieth century. Although one wishes that the author would have continued his institutional history of the Phoenix Indian School past 1935, still readers will find a balanced and highly readable account of assimilationist educational policies through their inception under Commissioner Thomas Jefferson Morgan to their abandonment under Commissioner John Collier. What is more, it is a study of the way national policies operated in a typical government off-reservation boarding school. In that sense, the work is unique and certain to inspire scholars to examine other Indian schools in like fashion.

The Phoenix Indian Industrial Boarding School, founded for the specific purpose of preparing American Indian children for assimilation, opened in 1891. During its first forty years, its goal was to remove Indian youths from their traditional cultures and to force them to adopt the values of the white middle class. Yet, as Trennert makes clear, the definition of assimilation changed over the decades, and these shifts in policy by the federal government compelled the school also to modify emphases. "It is the changing concept of assimilationist education," the author writes, "that forms the basis of this book" (p. xi).

Trennert divides the work into three parts, each organized chronologically. The first section uses as the center of discussion the tenure of the various superintendents. Their stories pull the reader into the politics of the institution. Despite the professional bu-

THE JOURNAL OF ARIZONA HISTORY

reaucocracy directing policy from Washington, D.C., the school took on the attributes of the persons who ran it. Indeed, Phoenix Indian School developed a personality of its own. It was affected by circumstances not recognized by policymakers and thus did not always follow national trends.

In the second section, Trennert analyzes the relationship between the city of Phoenix and the school. The school's effect on the local economy is examined closely. Phoenicians coveted the school's payroll and contracts in the same way that other communities coveted, say, military posts. The most interesting, and troubling, account involves the controversial "outing system" adopted from Carlisle Indian Industrial Training School in Pennsylvania, where students were sent to live and work with white families and thereby complete their cultural reprogramming. In Phoenix the greatest demand was for domestic servants. Young women and girls filled their waking hours not with mastering the intricacies of arithmetic and the English language, but in endless chores to make more comfortable the lives of white Americans.

The third section explores the experiences of the students themselves. "Student Life" (Chapter 6) is the most evocative. It is here that the students tell their stories, often with stark eloquence. Remarkably, despite the harsh discipline and military regimentation, many former students spoke of their years in Phoenix with affection. In this chapter the author is at his objective best, showing that the students' experiences were as varied and unique as the tribes they represented.

Based on extensive research, including interviews with school alumni, Trennert's work is a model of historical objectivity and deserves a readership other than academicians.

L. G. MOSES

Northern Arizona University

THE HOPI PHOTOGRAPHS: Kate Cory, 1905-1912. By Marnie Gaede, Barton Wright, and Marc Gaede. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1988. 154 pages. \$35.00 (hard cover), \$19.95 (soft cover).

KATE CORY HAS A SPECIAL PLACE among the many people who photographed the Hopi before Hopi elders decided to prohibit photography on the reservation. She was an artist first, then a creator of photographic images, possibly (but we do not know for certain) in-